

# Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences



Volume 19, Issue 3, (2024) 301-308

www.cjes.eu

# The impact of human resources competency and spiritual intelligence on the performance of teachers

**Weni Rosdiana**<sup>a\*</sup>, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Surabaya, Indonesia. **Nana Noviana**<sup>b</sup>, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Surabaya, Indonesia

#### **Suggested Citation:**

Rosdiana, W. & Noviana, N. (2024). The impact of human resources competency and spiritual intelligence on the performance of teachers. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Science*, 19(3), 301-308. https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v19i3.6981

Received from November 21, 2023; revised from January 12, 2024; accepted from April 11, 2024. Selection and peer review under the responsibility of Prof. Dr. Hafize Keser, Ankara University, Turkey (retired) © 2024 by the authors. Licensee United World Innovation Research and Publishing Center, North Nicosia, Cyprus. This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

iThenticate Similarity Rate: 15%

#### **Abstract**

Because of the numerous adjustments teachers must make in response to evolving instructional circumstances, their performance is currently emphasized. This serves as the context for understanding how well teachers are performing in terms of spiritual intelligence and human resources competency. Utilizing a quantitative methodology, this study collects data from vocational school teachers in Indonesia's East Java Province by use of questionnaires. After 276 questionnaires were received and deemed eligible, SEM PLS was used to evaluate the data. This study indicates that factors related to spiritual intelligence can act as a moderator to strengthen the relationship between human resources competence and improved teacher performance. Both human resources competence and spiritual intelligence are positive contributors to improved teacher performance. A clearer path is provided by spiritual intelligence. Teachers will find it simpler to perform at their best if they are not just competent but also have a work ethic that is devoted, willing/obedient, compassionate, grateful, and respectful of others.

Keywords: Competence; human resources; spiritual intelligence; teacher's performance

\* ADDRESS FOR CORRESPONDENCE: Weni Rosdiana, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Surabaya, Indonesia. E-mail address: wenirosdiana@unesa.ac.id

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

Currently, the teaching profession in Indonesia or even throughout the world is required to be adaptive to technology because since the COVID-19 pandemic hit the whole world; the learning system has changed drastically. In the past, learning was carried out face-to-face, now it is carried out using a remote system with technology as a media for teacher and student interfaces. The age of teachers varies, some are in the baby boomer generation, generations X and Y. Most teachers are digital migrants born before the 19th century, while those who understand technology were born after the 19th century (Singh, 2016). This affects the ability of teachers to adopt technology. Many teachers are technology stutterers (Rosalina et al., 2020; Chu et al., 2023; Heine et al., 2023). Moreover, facing the current situation, an event that was not predicted in advance further adds to the teacher's unpreparedness to deal with it.

When viewed from the context of social transformation and modern society, digitalization has penetrated all aspects of life. This leads to changes in standards, requirements, and demands on a job, including the teaching profession (Marienko et al., 2020). Teachers are required to always hone competence so that they can work in dynamic situations, and adapt, including using technology. Competence refers to professional skills with an ethical balance that includes cognitive, affective, and emotional (Fenwick & Edwards, 2016; Cai et al., 2022). Teacher performance includes teaching competence, social competence, educational competence, and technological competence (Sulaiman & Ismail, 2020; Bjorklund et al., 2020). Competence in a teacher describes the knowledge gained from experience and understanding of teaching practice (Sulaiman & Ismail, 2020; Mashhadlou & Izadpanah 2021). So the improvement or development of teacher competence becomes important as an investment to obtain effective and productive resources in the workplace (Chand, 2024).

In addition to competence, teachers in this century are important to have spiritual intelligence. This concept was put forward by Zohar (2010), who stated that spiritual intelligence is the difference between an individual and another individual. Spiritual intelligence describes morals and the ability to respond to rigid rules with an understanding of compassion. Philosophical intelligence that integrates spiritual, moral, emotional, transcendental, cosmic, and religious intelligence is presented by spiritual intelligence. A person with spiritual intelligence is better able to recognize, understand, and resolve any issue with compassion and knowledge while preserving harmony (Talukdar & Ghosh, 2017).

Having the competence to give self-confidence, enthusiasm for teachers to actualize themselves optimally, and spiritual intelligence encourages them to always think and behave positively, calmly, and patiently so that they can display mature and independent psychological conditions in the workplace. These two things are important for teachers to have because they are tasked with being mentors and educators for the nation's next generation. Teachers who are competent and have good spiritual intelligence will generally feel satisfied with their workplace and have an impact on achieving optimal performance (Kulshrestha & Singhal, 2017).

#### 1.1. Literature review

#### 1.1.1. Human resources competence

Competence can be thought of as a broad canopy that includes all aspects of performance realization. The ability to carry out a variety of activities in a work is what is referred to as competence (Talukdar & Ghosh, 2017). According to Rastgoo (2016), competence is demonstrated by an individual's actions and behavior in completing tasks, responding to issues, and finding solutions. According to Lauchande et al. (2017), competence is the capacity to use behavior, knowledge, skills, and personality to accomplish organizational and individual tasks for better work performance. Competence in human resources is an organizational asset for competitive advantage, a crucial component of operational efficiency and business performance (Kanokorn et al., 2012), and it plays a role in developing and maintaining (Lauchande et al., 2017). Human resource competency is comprised of three elements: knowledge, skill, and ability (Willian et al., 2021).

#### 1.1.2. Spiritual intelligence

Individuals who have strong spiritual intelligence will have an intense sense of wholeness, and attachment and have a deep value in their workplace (Emmons, 2003; Sirine & Kurniawati, 2018). Individuals with spiritual intelligence know the importance of one's life, and the quality of relationships with colleagues and others, and align themselves with values and work culture (Dwivedi, 2020). Individuals with spiritual intelligence always evoke feelings of attachment and view the work and people involved as meaningful (Rezapouraghdam et al., 2018). Spiritual intelligence is considered important to boost performance, provide inner peace for organizational members, and foster enthusiasm and mutual trust (Smith et al., 2015). So that positive feelings felt by all members of the organization can encourage increased performance (Kulshrestha & Singhal, 2017).

#### 1.1.3. Performance

According to Zeglat and Janbeik (2019), performance is the capacity of an individual to do his work obligations by possessing the requisite knowledge, expertise, motivation, and attitudes. The term "performance" refers to actual performance on the job, which is work performance or a goal that needs to be accomplished (Kanokorn, Pongtorn, & Somjai, 2012). According to Kulshrestha and Singhal (2017), performance is a management commitment that has a defined aim that can be met by staff members or organizations.

It is possible to quantify performance in the form of an individual's activity or the execution of a task that they finish within a specific time frame. Performance is very close to satisfaction (Afshar & Doosti, 2016; Pilarta, 2015), and many other studies measure performance with satisfaction indicators involving other indicators, involving performance allowances, work discipline, work culture, and leadership (Hendrawijaya et al., 2020; Kagema & Irungu, 2018). This study uses the opinion of Zeglat and Janbeik (2019) which measures performance on individual performance, with task performance and contextual performance as indicators.

## 1.2. Purpose of study

The purpose of this study is to determine the level of spiritual intelligence and human resources competency among teachers. The study's hypotheses are based on the justification provided in the literature review section:

- H1: Human resource competence has a positive and significant effect on performance.
- H2: Spiritual intelligence has a positive and significant effect on performance.
- H3: Spiritual intelligence mediates positively and significantly on the relationship between human resource competence and performance.

# 2. METHOD AND MATERIALS

# 2.1. Data collection tool

This study uses a quantitative approach, with questionnaires used to collect data. Questionnaires were sent to Vocational School teachers in East Java Province, Indonesia. The statements that were taken from several earlier studies include three statements about human resource competence from Willian et al., (2021), two statements about performance from Zeglat & Janbeik (2019), and five statements about spiritual intelligence from Sirine & Kurniawati (2018).

## 2.2. Participants

Questionnaires were distributed to 400 Vocational School teachers, and as many as 276 questionnaires were returned and 248 were declared eligible.

#### 2.3. Analysis

Regression analysis and confirmatory factor analysis were employed in this work. The instrument reliability testing was carried out with SPSS, and the instrument value was deemed reliable if Cronbach's

alpha was  $\geq$  0.6. The validity of the instrument was assessed using the product-moment correlation approach, which is to be eligible if the value of r $\geq$ 0.3.

#### 3. RESULTS

As demonstrated in Table 1, the findings of the validity and reliability tests are incorporated into every statement for every variable.

**Table 1** *Validity and reliability test* 

Statement		r value	Cronbach's alpha	
Human resource competence				
Knowledge		3.91	0.82	
Skill		3.98	0.71	
Ability		3.93	0.70	
	Average	3.94	0.74	
Spiritual intelligence				
Faithfull		4.49	0.72	
Willingness		4.51	0.74	
Care		4.53	0.68	
Gratitude		4.19	0.80	
Appreciate		4.28	0.68	
	Average	4.40	0.72	
Performance				
Task performance		3.96	0.83	
Contextual performance		3.91	0.85	
	Average	3.94	0.82	

Each statement's validity and dependability are demonstrated by the validity and reliability tests in Table 1. Each statement's validity and dependability are demonstrated by the validity and reliability tests in Table 1. The average dependability is greater than 0.6 and the average validity is greater than 0.3. The loading factor will then be determined using a confirmatory factor analysis. This analysis provides information on the most prominent dimensions of the variables employed and explains the correlation between one variable and the formed factors.

 Table 2

 Confirmatory factor analysis (CFA)

Dimension	Loading factor		
Human resource competence			
Knowledge	0.884		
Skill	0.900		
Ability	0.902		
Spiritual intelligence			
Faithfull	0.973		
Willingness	0.875		
Care	0.896		
Gratitude	0.912		
Appreciate	0.900		
Performance			
Task performance	0.950		
Contextual performance	0.885		

The competency of human resources, the assertion that teachers should possess the highest loading factor-related ability, and the statement regarding knowledge with the lowest value are all explained by the confirmatory factor analysis presented in Table 2. The claim that task performance is crucial has the highest loading factor in terms of performance. Regarding the spiritual intelligence variable, the statement that instructors ought to be devoted has the largest loading factor, while comments about teachers' eagerness to teach should have the lowest loading factor.

Regression analysis is used at the end of the test to ascertain the direct correlation between the variables and the mediating role of spiritual intelligence (table 3).

 Table 3

 Linear regression test for direct relationship

Hypotheses		Reg. Coeff	t-Count	Sig	Result
H1: Human resource competence performance	$\rightarrow$	0.640	7.088	0.000	Accepted
H2: Spiritual intelligence → performance		0.559	6.534	0.000	Accepted

It is evident from the relationship between the independent and dependent variables that the relationship is acceptable. It is established that 7.088 > 2.626 and 6.534 > 2.626 correspond to t-Count > t-Table. Additionally, research demonstrates that performance is largely dependent on human resource competence (64%), which contributes to performance, and spiritual intelligence (55%), which is largely dependent on performance.

**Table 4** *Mediation test* 

Hunothosos	Spiritual in			
Hypotheses	ß	t-Count	Sig	Result
H3:	0.739	8.718	0.000	Accepted
Human resource competence → spiritual				
intelligence → performance				

Test results showed that spiritual intelligence was successful in mediating the relationship between performance and human resource competence, as evidenced by t-Count > tTable, or 8,718 > 2,626, and that the relationship was stronger in 73% of cases than in 64% when performance was directly influenced by human resource competence.

# 4. DISCUSSION

This study supports previous research conducted by Kanokorn et al., (2012); Lauchande et al., (2017); Kazu & Demiralp (2016) by stating that there is a positive and significant relationship between human resource competence and performance. Currently, the competencies needed to contribute to performance are increasing, because conditions are increasingly unpredictable and change rapidly. Competence of human resources is emphasized on the abilities that are the basis for the quality of one's work. Teacher competence based on previous research mentioned the need for training and support from external parties such as the government and its organizations. Training can improve knowledge, skills, and abilities which in this study are indicators of teacher competence. The involvement of these parties is important, where the organization provides facilities and controls policies by the government.

Additionally, this study discovered a strong and positive correlation between spiritual intelligence and performance, supporting earlier findings by Upadhyay & Upadhyay (2016) and Dwivedi (2020) as well as current expectations that a teacher should be passionate, have a caring attitude, and have a

meaningful perspective on both his work and his students. With spiritual intelligence, a teacher can take ownership of meaning and value and open up new avenues for students to receive and utilize it. It encourages them to take advantage of every opportunity that arises. Similar to how educators deal with the need to adjust to change these days. So faithful, willingness, care, gratitude, and appreciation are chosen in attitude. Complaining for them will hurt psychology and will not solve the problem. They believe that this is the will of God and a natural phenomenon that humans can only face and resolve. This attitude fosters a healthy and grateful way of life.

#### 5. CONCLUSION

This study demonstrates how spiritual intelligence can improve the correlation between performance and human resources competency. A person who possess spiritual intelligence feels more confident in improving their competence because they are grateful for God's benefits and believe that humans owe it to him by improving their current level of competence.

This study has limitations, in that this research only touches on the competence and spiritual intelligence of vocational school teachers, while these two things also apply to other professions to measure performance. So that the next research can continue with other professions. As well as being more holistic, such as adding other variables due to unpredictable changes.

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Ethical Approval: The study adheres to the ethical guidelines for conducting research.

**Funding:** This research received no external funding.

#### **REFERENCES**

- Afshar, H. S., & Doosti, M. (2016). Investigating the impact of job satisfaction/dissatisfaction on Iranian English teachers' job performance. *Iranian Journal of Language Teaching Research*, 4(1), 97-115. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1127427
- Bjorklund, P., Daly, A. J., Ambrose, R., & van Es, E. A. (2020). Connections and Capacity: An Exploration of Preservice Teachers' Sense of Belonging, Social Networks, and Self-Efficacy in Three Teacher Education Programs. *AERA Open*, 6(1). <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/2332858420901496">https://doi.org/10.1177/2332858420901496</a>
- Cai, B., Shafait, Z., & Chen, L. (2022). Teachers' adoption of emotions-based learning outcomes: Significance of teachers' competence, creative performance, and university performance. Frontiers in Psychology, 13, 812447. https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.812447/full
- Chand, S. P. (2024). Teacher's views on professional learning and development in primary schools in Fiji. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 1-12. <a href="https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s12564-024-10004-3">https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s12564-024-10004-3</a>
- Chu, J., Lin, R., Qin, Z., Chen, R., Lou, L., & Yang, J. (2023). Exploring factors influencing pre-service teacher's digital teaching competence and the mediating effects of data literacy: empirical evidence from China. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 10(1), 1-11. <a href="https://www.nature.com/articles/s41599-023-02016-y">https://www.nature.com/articles/s41599-023-02016-y</a>
- Dwivedi, S. K. (2020). Emotional Intelligence and Spiritual Intelligence of the Secondary School Teachers about Teacher Effectiveness. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Educational Research*, *9*(5), 102-116.
- Emmons, R. A. (2003). The psychology of ultimate concerns: Motivation and spirituality in personality.

  Guilford

  Press.

  <a href="https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=3MiPuNYZHdYC&oi=fnd&pg=PA1&dq=Emmons,+R.+(1999).+The+psychology+of+ultimate+concerns:+Motivation+and+spirituality+in+personality.</a>

- Rosdiana, W. & Noviana, N. (2024). The impact of human resources competency and spiritual intelligence on the performance of teachers. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Science*, 19(3), 301-308. <a href="https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v19i3.6981">https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v19i3.6981</a>
  - <u>nality.+New+York:+Guilford.+https://www.guilford.com/books/The-Psychology-of-Ultimate-Concerns/+&ots=6ljDC8M7iw&sig=GPpaVIKY2b\_qQ6CWxRM-Ll3rtyl</u>
- Fenwick, T., & Edwards, R. (2016). Exploring the impact of digital technologies on professional responsibilities and education. *European Educational Research Journal*, 15(1), 117-131. <a href="https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1474904115608387">https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1474904115608387</a>
- Heine, S., Krepf, M., & König, J. (2023). Digital resources as an aspect of teacher professional digital competence: One term, different definitions—a systematic review. *Education and Information Technologies*, 28(4), 3711-3738. <a href="https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10639-022-11321-2">https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10639-022-11321-2</a>
- Hendrawijaya, A. T., Hilmi, M. I., Hasan, F., Imsiyah, N., & Indrianti, D. T. (2020). Determinants of Teacher Performance with Job Satisfactions Mediation. *International Journal of Instruction*, *13*(3), 845-860. <a href="https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1259672">https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1259672</a>
- Kagema, J., & Irungu, C. (2018). An analysis of teacher performance appraisals and their influence on teacher performance in secondary schools in Kenya. *International Journal of Education*, *11*(1), 93-98. <a href="https://www.learntechlib.org/P/208936/">https://www.learntechlib.org/P/208936/</a>
- Kanokorn, S., Pongtorn, P., & Somjai, M. (2012). Teacher development program to enhance learning competency for small primary schools in Thailand. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *69*, 1052-1058. <a href="https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1877042812054924">https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1877042812054924</a>
- Kazu, H., & Demiralp, D. (2016). Faculty members' views on the effectiveness of teacher training programs to upskill life-long learning competence. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 16(63). <a href="https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/ejer/issue/24399/258655">https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/ejer/issue/24399/258655</a>
- Kulshrestha, S., & Singhal, T. K. (2017). Impact of spiritual intelligence on performance and job satisfaction: A study on school teachers. *International Journal of Human Resource & Industrial Research*, 4(2), 1-6. <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Tarun-Singhal-5/publication/315518240">https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Tarun-Singhal-5/publication/315518240</a> IMPACT OF SPIRITUAL INTELLIGENCE ON PERFORMANCE AND JOB SATISFACTION A STUDY ON SCHOOL TEACHERS/links/5aad3c080f7e9b4897be94e7/IMPACT-OF-SPIRITUAL-INTELLIGENCE-ON-PERFORMANCE-AND-JOB-SATISFACTION-A-STUDY-ON-SCHOOL-TEACHERS.pdf
- Lauchande, C., Passos, A., & Howie, S. J. (2017). Teacher's Competence and Performance and Its Effect on Pupil Achievement in Upper Primary Education in Mozambique: What Does SACMEQ Data Tell Us. In *Monitoring the quality of education in schools,* 139-158. https://brill.com/downloadpdf/book/edcoll/9789463004534/BP000011.pdf
- Marienko, M., Nosenko, Y., Sukhikh, A., Tataurov, V., & Shyshkina, M. (2020). Personalization of learning through adaptive technologies in the context of sustainable development of teachers' education. arXiv preprint arXiv:2006.05810. https://arxiv.org/abs/2006.05810
- Mashhadlou, H., & Izadpanah, S. (2021). Assessing Iranian EFL teachers' educational performance based on gender and years of teaching experience. *Language Testing in Asia*, 11(1), 23. <a href="https://link.springer.com/article/10.1186/s40468-021-00140-7">https://link.springer.com/article/10.1186/s40468-021-00140-7</a>
- Pilarta, M. A. B. (2015). Job satisfaction and teachers' performance in Abra State Institute of Sciences and Technology. *Global Journal of Management and Business Research*, *15*(4), 81-85. https://www.academia.edu/download/56200723/1626-1-1605-1-10-20150711.pdf
- Rastgoo, P. (2016). The role of human resources competency in improving the manager's performance. *Acta Universitatis Agriculturae et Silviculturae Mendelianae Brunensis*, *64*(1), 341-350. https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/9708/5315704476d62787a8d66557bd0779c05de9.pdf
- Rezapouraghdam, H., Alipour, H., & Darvishmotevali, M. (2018). Employee workplace spirituality and pro-environmental behavior in the hotel industry. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, *26*(5), 740-758. <a href="https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09669582.2017.1409229">https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09669582.2017.1409229</a>

- Rosdiana, W. & Noviana, N. (2024). The impact of human resources competency and spiritual intelligence on the performance of teachers. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Science*, 19(3), 301-308. <a href="https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v19i3.6981">https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v19i3.6981</a>
- Rosalina, E., Nasrullah, N., & Elyani, E. P. (2020). Teacher's challenges towards online learning in pandemic era. *LET: Linguistics, Literature and English Teaching Journal*, 10(2), 71-88. <a href="https://jurnal.uin-antasari.ac.id/index.php/let/article/view/4118">https://jurnal.uin-antasari.ac.id/index.php/let/article/view/4118</a>
- Singh, G. (2016). Challenges for Teachers in the Era of E-learning in India. Scholedge International Journal of Multidisciplinary & Allied Studies, 3(2). <a href="https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&profile=ehost&scope=site&authtype=crawler&jrnl=2394336X&AN=113913275&h=wLfL4LCKUeu%2B23l9a8dl3h81CE7Z6zudB0x6oxXi2jCpRy%2B0%2F0yF3dSqS0lV343RS%2FqpHQ3lc%2Fk9086rijShTQ%3D%3D&crl=c
- Sirine, H., & Kurniawati, E. P. (2018). The importance of spirituality dimensions in the development of entrepreneurship. *Diponegoro International Journal of Business*, 1(2), 55-70. https://ejournal2.undip.ac.id/index.php/ijb/article/view/2694
- Smith, J., Charles, G., & Hesketh, I. (2015). Developing understanding of the spiritual aspects to resilience. *International Journal of Public Leadership*, 11(1), 34-45. https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/IJPL-06-2014-0006/full/html
- Sulaiman, J., & Ismail, S. N. (2020). Teacher competence and 21st-century skills in transformation schools 2025 (TS25). *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 8(8), 3536-3544. https://www.academia.edu/download/98607619/UJER29-19516298.pdf
- Talukdar, S., & Gayen, S. G. (2017). Spiritual intelligence and teaching competency of secondary school teachers in south Bengal. *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 7(12), 472-487. <a href="https://www.indianjournals.com/ijor.aspx?target=ijor:ijrss&volume=7&issue=12&article=037">https://www.indianjournals.com/ijor.aspx?target=ijor:ijrss&volume=7&issue=12&article=037</a>
- Upadhyay, S., & Upadhyay, N. (2016). A multi-criteria decision framework to measure spiritual intelligence of university teachers. *Procedia Computer Science*, *91*, 591-598. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1877050916313436
- Willian, R., Hasbullah, H., Widiastuti, F., & Dahmiri, D. (2021). The influence of human resource competency and entrepreneurial characteristics on the performance of small and medium industries. *Jurnal Perspektif Pembiayaan dan Pembangunan Daerah*, *9*(2), 153-160. <a href="https://online-journal.unja.ac.id/JES/article/view/10603">https://online-journal.unja.ac.id/JES/article/view/10603</a>
- Zeglat, D., & Janbeik, S. (2019). Meaningful work and organizational outcomes: The mediating role of individual work performance. *Management Research Review*, 42(7), 859-878. <a href="https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/MRR-05-2018-0206/full/html">https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/MRR-05-2018-0206/full/html</a>
- Zohar, D. (2010). Exploring spiritual capital: An interview with Danah Zohar. *Spirituality in Higher Education*, *5*(5),

  https://www.academia.edu/download/53632293/%D9%85%D9%82%D8%A7%D9%84%D9%87

  \_%DB%8C %D8%A7%D8%AE%D9%84%D8%A7%D9%82.pdf